立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(4)894/2023(05)

Ref.: CB4/PS/2/22

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways Meeting on 20 October 2023

Background brief on Kwu Tung Station and Tuen Mun South Extension

Purpose

This paper provides updated background information on Kwu Tung ("KTU") Station of the Northern Link ("NOL") and Tuen Mun South Extension ("TME"), both of which are included in the seven railway projects proposed under the Railway Development Strategy 2014 ("RDS-2014"). It also summarizes the major views and concerns expressed by Subcommittee members during previous discussions on the subject.

Background

Kwu Tung Station

- 2. The proposed KTU Station is Phase 1 of the NOL project and will be constructed on the existing Lok Ma Chau Spur Line of the East Rail Line. Under the ownership approach, the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") will be responsible for the financing, design, construction, operation and maintenance of KTU Station and will own it.
- 3. When the Subcommittee was briefed on the way forward of the NOL project on 15 January 2021, the then estimated capital cost for KTU Station was about \$3.5 billion (in December 2015 prices). The updated capital cost of KTU Station project is now estimated to be \$9.8 billion (in July 2023 prices). Funding support to bridge the funding gap would take the form of a fixed lump sum amount to be deducted from the full market value land premium of Areas 20, 22 and 25 of the Kwu Tung North New Development Area ("KTN NDA"). The Executive Council approved the above financial arrangement for KTU Station on 5 September 2023. According to the Administration, the main construction

works of KTU Station would commence in the third quarter of 2023 for completion in 2027.

Tuen Mun South Extension

- 4. The proposed TME includes an approximately 2.4-kilometre long elevated railway that will extend the Tuen Ma Line ("TML") from the existing Tuen Mun Station to a new Tuen Mun South ("TMS") Station near the Tuen Mun Ferry Terminal. A new intermediate station, namely A16 Station, will be added at Tuen Mun Area 16 ("Area 16"). As indicated by the Administration, all the community facilities affected by the TME construction works, including the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool, will be reprovisioned prior to their demolition. Under the ownership approach, MTRCL will be responsible for the financing, design, construction, operation and maintenance of the TME and will own it.
- 5. When the Subcommittee was briefed on the way forward of the TME project on 5 June 2020, the then estimated capital cost for the project was about \$11.4 billion (in December 2015 prices). The updated capital cost estimate of the TME project is now \$15.8 billion (in July 2023 prices). Funding support to bridge the funding gap would take the form of a fixed lump sum amount to be deducted from the full market value land premium of Tuen Mun Area 16. The Executive Council approved the above financial arrangement for TME on 5 September 2023. According to the Administration, the main construction works of the TME project will start in the third quarter of 2023 for completion in 2030.

Major views and concerns of members

6. The Administration consulted the Subcommittee on the proposed way forward of TME and NOL at its meetings on 5 June 2020 and 15 January 2021 respectively. The Subcommittee was further briefed on the latest development of RDS-2014 (which includes TME and NOL) at its meeting on 3 February 2023. The major views and concerns raised by members are summarized in the ensuing paragraphs.

Tuen Mun South Extension

Reprovisioning of the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool

7. Members were concerned about the timetable and potential sites for the reprovisioning of the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool, as well as the facilities to be provided at the new swimming pool. At the Subcommittee meeting on 5 June 2020, some members suggested the Administration to explore every possible

means to reprovision the existing community facilities, including the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool, in-situ. Other members urged the Administration not to demolish the existing swimming pool until the construction of a new swimming pool had been completed. Two motions were passed at the meeting reflecting members' suggestions, among other things, and attached as **Appendices 1 and 2**.

8. At the Subcommittee meeting on 3 February 2023, members enquired whether the transition period before and after the reprovision of the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool could be shortened. The Administration responded that it had examined reprovisioning the swimming pool in phases, but concluded that the phased approach would be of little help to the project progress. Moreover, having considered the high utilization rate of the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool and the views of the District Council and local community, the approach of "reprovisioning before demolition" was adopted for the project.

Residential development at Tuen Mun Area 16 and the carrying capacity of the Tuen Ma Line

- 9. At the Subcommittee meeting on 5 June 2020, members pointed out that there was already a total of 110 000 residents living in the vicinity of the proposed TMS Station and A16 Station. They raised concerns on the carrying capacity of TML in coping with the future additional passenger demand after the completion of TME. One of the motions passed at the meeting (**Appendix 1**) included requesting MTRCL to increase the train frequency upon the commissioning of TME.
- 10. The Administration advised that the additional population to be housed by the residential development at the Area 16 site would depend on the detailed planning and design of the project. It further explained that there would be no transport justification to provide a station at Area 16 if there were no additional population, as the transport demand of the existing population could be catered for by road transport.
- 11. In response to members' concerns about the noise impact caused to the nearby residents by the railway viaduct of the proposed A16 Station, the Administration responded that the detailed planning and design stage of the project would include carrying out an environmental impact assessment, in which the noise impact on nearby residents arising from the railway alignment would be assessed.
- 12. At the Subcommittee meeting on 3 February 2023, members further followed up on the carrying capacity of the TML in accommodating patronage from the two new railway stations upon the completion of TME. The Administration responded that the current train frequency of TML was 22 trains

per hour and MTRCL could increase the frequency to 24 trains per hour as and when appropriate. Once all the trains procured and converted for the Shatin to Central Link project had commenced service, a train frequency of 26 trains per hour could be reached.

Kwu Tung Station

Tie-in with the population intake of Kwu Tung North New Development Area

- 13. At the Subcommittee meeting on 15 January 2021, many members expressed dissatisfaction about the long lead time required for taking forward the project, noting with concern that KTU Station would still be under construction when the first population intake of public housing units in KTN NDA commences in 2026. Some members suggested that NOL Phase 1 and Phase 2 should be carried out concurrently to compress the construction time of the whole NOL project.
- 14. The Administration explained that the main consideration in carrying out the construction of NOL in two phases was to facilitate the early commissioning of KTU Station so that the residents of KTN NDA could enjoy the new railway as early as possible. With the population intake of public housing units in KTN NDA to commence progressively from 2026 onwards, by the time KTU Station was expected to be commissioned in 2027, about 7 400 public housing units (i.e. about one quarter) would have been completed. Nevertheless, the Administration would explore with MTRCL ways to expedite the implementation of NOL Phase 1.

High construction cost

- 15. At the Subcommittee meeting on 15 January 2021, several members were concerned about the high construction cost of the project and an enquiry was raised about the future property developments atop KTU Station. Other members also expressed concern over MTRCL's monopoly and encouraged the Administration to consider other corporations for future railway projects.
- 16. The Administration explained that the cost estimates submitted by MTRCL would be rigorously examined by both the Administration and its independent consultant to ascertain the necessary funding support. As regards property development, the Administration advised that suitable sites in the vicinity of KTU Station had been identified and it was proposed that the property development rights of those sites should be granted to MTRCL under the "Railway-plus-Property" development model to bridge the funding gap of the KTU Station and the detailed planning and design of NOL Phase 2. The

Administration would not rule out the possibility of implementing independent railway projects by other corporations in future.

Latest position

17. The Administration plans to update members on the latest progress of KTU Station and TME at the Subcommittee meeting to be held on 20 October 2023.

Relevant papers

18. A list of relevant papers is in **Appendix 3.**

Council Business Division 4
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
16 October 2023

交通事務委員會

鐵路事宜小組委員會

在 2020 年 6 月 5 日會議上通過議程項目 II "屯門南延線"的議案

行政長官會同行政會議已批准政府邀請港鐵公司開展屯門南延線項目的詳細規劃及設計,預期於二零二三年動工,二零三零年落成。鑑於延線車站服務範圍涉及屯門碼頭一帶及未來16區發展項目,無論車站興建期間或落成通車後都對當區為數超過十萬名居民構成直接影響,為此,本會促請當局:

- 必須設法保留或原區重置現有社區設施,包括天后廟行人橋及皇珠路行車橋等多條主要行人天橋、屯門泳池、消防局、 綠在屯門、湖山路公園、擬建的16區運動場等;及
- 2. 要求港鐵公司承諾於延線通車後必須加密西鐵班次及加強服務,以應付現時及未來新遷入居民的出行需要。
- 3. 要求政府啟動屯荃葵沙鐵路建設方案進行研究,以應付未來 新界西人口增長需求。

動議人: 陳恒鑌議員, BBS, JP和議人: 梁志祥議員, BBS, JP

(Translation)

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Motion passed under agenda item II on "Tuen Mun South Extension" at the meeting on 5 June 2020

The Chief Executive in Council has given approval for the Government to

invite the MTR Corporation Limited ("MTRCL") to proceed with the detailed planning and design of the Tuen Mun South ("TMS") Extension project, which is expected to commence in 2023 and complete in 2030. Given that the catchment area of the stations along TMS Extension covers the areas around Tuen Mun Ferry Pier and the future development projects at the Area 16 ("A16") site, the project will have direct impact on more than 100 000 residents in the district both during the construction period and after commissioning of the stations. In this connection, this Subcommittee urges the authorities to:

- 1. explore every possible means to retain or reprovision the existing community facilities in-situ, including a number of major pedestrian and vehicular bridges such as Tin Hau Temple footbridge and Wong Chu Road flyover, Tuen Mun Swimming Pool, fire services station, Tuen Mun Community Green Station, the park at Wu Shan Road, the proposed sports ground at A16 site, etc.;
- 2. request MTRCL to undertake to increase the train frequency and enhance the service of the West Rail Line upon the commissioning of the TMS Extension, so as to meet the travelling needs of the existing and future residents; and
- 3. request the Government to commence the study on the proposed construction of the Tuen Mun-Tsuen Wan-Kwai Chung-Sha Tin Railway to meet the future demands of the growing population in New Territories West.

Moved by: Hon CHAN Han-pan, BBS, JP

Seconded by: Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, SBS, MH, JP

交通事務委員會

鐵路事宜小組委員會

在 2020 年 6 月 5 日會議上通過議程項目 II "屯門南延線"的議案

鑑於屯門南延線以「擁有權」模式為融資基礎,本委員會促請政府,以不耗費公帑為原則,要求港鐵興建的物業當中,至少七成為公營房屋,並由港鐵支付所有建築費,落成後將有關物業無條件交予政府。至於受興建第16區車站影響,而需重建的屯門泳池,需在新泳池落成後,舊泳池才能清拆,確保居民康樂設施不減。

動議人: 田北辰議員, BBS, JP

(Translation)

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Motion passed under agenda item II on "Tuen Mun South Extension" at the meeting on 5 June 2020

Given that the Tuen Mun South Extension is financed under the ownership approach, this Subcommittee urges the Government to, under the principle of not incurring public funds, request the MTR Corporation Limited to designate at least 70% of its residential properties to be public housing, to pay all the construction costs therefor and to unconditionally hand over the residential properties concerned to the Government upon completion. As regards the Tuen Mun Swimming Pool which needs to be reprovisioned due to the construction of the Area 16 Station, the existing swimming pool should not be demolished until the construction of the new swimming pool has been completed, so as to ensure that there will be no reduction in recreational facilities available to residents.

Moved by: Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP

"Kwu Tung Station and Tuen Mun South Extension"

List of relevant papers

Committee	Meeting Date	Papers
Subcommittee	27 October 2014	Agenda Item III: Railway development
on Matters		<u>Minutes</u>
Relating to		Follow-up paper
Railways		
	5 June 2020	Agenda Item II: Tuen Mun South Extension
		<u>Minutes</u>
	15 January 2021	Agenda Item IV: Northern Link (and Kwu Tung
		Station)
		<u>Minutes</u>
	3 February 2023	Agenda Item II: Progress update on Railway
		Development Strategy 2014
		<u>Minutes</u>

Council Meeting	Papers
24 March 2021	Official Record of Proceedings Page 97-98 (LCQ 11)
16 November 2022	Official Record of Proceedings Page 270-275 (LCQ 14)

Council Business Division 4
<u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u>
16 October 2023